Measuring Your College's Effectiveness on Transfer, Employment, and Earnings Gains

The tables and definitions below provide transfer information from the National Student Clearinghouse, employment and earnings data from the LaunchBoard, and labor market information from EMSI.

- Table 1 presents your college's transfer outcomes in comparison to statewide figures and the top college in the state.
- Table 2 shows your college's top five transfer destinations.
- Table 3 presents your college's employment outcomes in comparison to statewide figures and the top college in the state.
- Table 4 shows how students fare in your five largest CTE programs.
- Table 5 puts your top five CTE programs in the context of the regional job market and expected educational attainment.

After reviewing this information, please respond to the questions below.

1) Reflections on Table 1: Overall, how is your college supporting transfer for your students? For example, are most transferring before or after earning a community college award? How do your college's figures compare to statewide and top college in the state's results?

RCC rates are aligned with the State's transfer out rates. Only 1/3 of students are awarded a degree or certificate before transferring to a four year college or university.

Internally, RCC's numbers for Fall 2010 First-Time Freshmen transferring are 31.5% (1,603 of 5095 students) with 6% of the overall students (305) or 19% of those who transferred receiving a degree before transferring.

Using the provided data, the College's transfer rates are about ½ that of the Top College's.
Overall, the college is supporting transfer for students in a variety of ways including:

- RCC Promise supports approximately 800 full-time students in pursuing a degree/transfer by providing funds for tuition, fees, a tablet, and books. RCC Promise will add over 1000 new students for academic year 2018-19.
- RCC is developing, refining, and clarifying program maps for students along with designing alternative transfer pathways (e.g., accelerated pathways in English and mathematics).
- Collaborative teams of Counselors, Educational Advisors, Faculty Advisors, Librarians, and Peer Mentors are providing integrated and comprehensive academic support for students in the "highways."
- RCC is committed to expanding its Career and Transfer Center space and services.
- RCC is collaborating with UCR and CSUSB to create maps showing major-specific bachelor's program requirements, recommended lower division course sequences, and progress milestones.

2) Reflections on Table 2: Where are your students most likely to transfer? Are there discrepancies in whether students earn a community college award before enrolling in each institution? What might account for these outcomes?

RCC's students largely stay local. Many of RCC's students state that RCC's location is the reason they chose this college over other area colleges. For four year college and university enrollment, that same preference is maintained. RCC does have a growing population of students who transfer to out-of-state public schools. From RCC's Fall 2017 Transfer Report:

"While receiving an RCC degree and / or certificate is a goal of many students, 55.3% of the students in the 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 Transfer Volume Cohort students transferred without having received an RCC degree or certificate. Historically, RCC's local degree requirements have

had an impact on students completing all necessary units for an AA or AS degree. These local requirements weren't necessarily aligned with CSU transfer requirements. As RCC continues to implement ADTs, which are aligned with CSU requirements, the college anticipates that the percentage of students who are awarded an ADT prior to transferring will increase. The beginning of this upward trend is seen in the 2016-2017 versus 2015-2016 cohorts – while representing only one year of data, 6% more of the Transfer Volume Cohort received a degree or certificate prior to transferring in 2016-2017 – 44.7% versus 38.9% for 2015-2016's cohort. "

California Baptist University is the most popular private university transfer destination for RCC students. It has, however, the lowest percent (among the top five) of transfers earning an award before transferring as students can transfer to a private institution even after a single semester. California State Polytechnic University, Pomona, is the third most popular public university transfer destination for RCC students. It has the largest (among the top five) percentage of transfers earning an award before transferring; many of these transfer students were in STEM fields.

3) Reflections on Table 3: Overall, how is your college supporting economic mobility for your students? For example, are most of your students able to get jobs and attain a living wage? Are your students able to improve their earnings? How do your figures compare to statewide and top college results?

RCC's employment rates are aligned with the statewide median. Riverside County's unemployment rate is aligned with the state's, which might partially account for the similarity. RCC's median change in earnings is higher than the statewide median's, but the proportion of graduates who have achieved living wage is slightly lower than the statewide median's.
All rates are considerably lower than the Top College results.
The CTE Outcomes Survey administered in early 2017 by email, text message and telephone, addressed student perceptions of their CTE program, employment outcomes and how their coursework and training relate to their current career. A total of 1,837 students were surveyed and 769 (42%) students responded. The following outcomes were reported:

1. How satisfied are students with the education and training they received at RCC?
   90.2% of respondents surveyed indicated that they were very satisfied or satisfied with their education and training. The statewide average was 91.1%

2. How many students secured a job that is closely related to their RCC program of study?
   70.5% of respondents indicated that they secured a job that was very close or close to their RCC program of study. RCC is higher than the statewide average of 69.2%

3. How many hours per week are employed students working?
   Respondents indicated that 90% of students are working more than 20 and up to more than 40 hours per week. RCC is higher than the statewide average of 89.5%.

4. How many months did it take students to find a job?
   88.9% of respondents indicated that they secured employment between 0-6 months after completing training. RCC students are finding employment quicker than the statewide average of 85.6%.

5. What were the hourly wages of students before RCC training versus after RCC training?
   Before training, respondents were earning $13.00 per hour. After training respondents indicated that were earning $20.00 per hour. RCC students, within the Inland Empire, are earning a $7.00 increase in pay after their training, whereas the statewide average is $6.00. According to the Living Wage calculator (http://livingwage.mit.edu/counties/06065) in Riverside County, the liveable wage for 1 adult is $12.10 per hour; 2 adults (with one adult working) is $19.51; and 1 adult and 1 child is $25.67. From this data, it shows growth in earnings; however, there is additional room for growth in order to increase the liveable wages our RCC completers are earning.

Key Results:

- $7.00 is the overall change in hourly wages after completing RCC training in dollars.
- 54% is the overall change in hourly wages after completing RCC training – in percentage gain.
- 81% of respondents reported being employed for pay.
- 17% of respondents reported transferring to another college or university. The statewide average for transferring to another college or university is 35% - and RCC has recognized that there is room for substantial growth in this area.
- 90% of respondents reported being very satisfied or satisfied with their training.

The preponderance of responded are employed and are working in the same field as their studies or training. Notably, students realize a greater wage gain after completing their studies at RCC if they secure a job that is similar to their program of study.

4) Reflections on Table 4: Do your highest-enrolled programs yield similar student outcomes to each other? Which programs provide the strongest economic return? What might account for these outcomes?

The outcomes for RCC's highest-enrolled programs vary widely. Childhood Development is included as one of the highest-enrolled programs but the proportion of students achieving living wages is very low. This is typical for employment in this field. However, median change in earnings for Childhood Development is significant – 81% -- almost as high as the Top College in CA rate (93%). In reviewing the Centers of Excellence data, occupations in the Childhood Development (also referenced as Early Childhood Education) including Preschool and Child Care Center Program Administrators, Directors of Education, Preschool Teachers (except Special Education), Teacher Assistants, Childcare workers and Recreation workers.   The jobs posted in 2010 equated to 44,345, and in 2015 there were 39,806 job available, which was a 10% reduction in available jobs.   The entry wage was reported as $8.66, the median wage was reported as $11.82, and the experienced wage was reported at $16.45 which aligns with first tier of the liveable wages reported through the Living Wage calculator (http://livingwage.mit.edu/counties/06065) for Riverside County. According to the projected occupation data, there is an anticipated 3% growth in annual openings between 2015 and 2020. The highest projected occupation with available positions within the Early Childhood Education discipline is within the elementary and secondary schools and within fitness and recreational sports centers.

With this information, it is important to note that within the field of Education Paraprofessional field (which include teacher assistants delivering direct services to students or parents), there is anticipated 29% occupational growth projected between 2015 and 2020 for those who can provide services for the elderly and persons with disabilities. This data has prompted the Early Childhood discipline leaders to begin to develop the Special Education degree and certificate patterns to meet these occupational needs.

RCC's Business Administration program students perform the best with 51% of students attaining a living wage, while the other 3 programs are fairly closely aligned. According to the Centers of Excellence data, there is a 14% occupational growth need between 2015 and 2020, with the entry level wage reported as $19.77, the median wage reported as $34.16 and the experienced wage reported as $61.78. It is important to note that there are over 39 different occupational codes that fall within Business Administration, with the highest wages reported in the areas of analysts, managers, and accountants. In order to provide RCC students with the ability to meet the desired qualifications for the higher wage jobs, the Business Administration team developed the Business Administration cohort pathway based on the AD-T in Business Administration.

Cohort information:

1. The cohort offers students guaranteed seats and guaranteed time to completion (2 years as long as they are college level English and Math ready)
2. Classes are held M-TH from 8-12:30, and can be held face-to-face, hybrid or online.

3. Each cohort student is required to participate in a Success Seminar – which is one hour per week where they sit down with their fellow student cohort members and a faculty mentor (faculty advisor) to go over a number of different topics (including college success strategies, time management, visits with 4-year partners, guest speakers from different disciplines, etc.) The Business faculty are currently developing the Success Seminar (I and II) through our Non-Credit curriculum protocols. These non-credit courses can be categorized as CDCP Non-Credit courses and provide the college enhanced apportionment.
4. We've built in stackable certificates into the program for students to complete as they complete the ADT.
5. We've built in tutoring and Supplemental Instruction into sections where data shows that students struggle.

Internal goals of Cohort program:

1. To work collaboratively with all disciplines to help the students get through the program within 2 years – graduate, and transfer.
2. To not disrupt any scheduling patterns that are currently in the queue (in other words, we work with what everyone already has scheduled for any given semester).
3. To provide "ghost" sections for these students who will be coded with "Cohort" Registration holds. This allows cohort students with their cohort PERC holds, to enroll in the sections that have the matching registration rule – this is so students can enroll using web advisor, rather than manual enrollment with our teams that are already swamped. These ghost sections do not have any load associated with them, and mirror the existing section. The class caps are reduced in the general section to accommodate the cohort students in the ghost section.
4. We only start new cohorts in the fall. But students can enter the cohort during any semester, and this is done on a case by case basis (in consultation with counseling and our Ed Advisor).
5. Research has shown that students do better in their educational journeys when they have active engagement. The Success Seminar courses provide the engagement strategies that students need. They develop cohesive units with fellow students, they know they have active support mechanisms with their faculty mentor, and they understand all of the resources available to them to ensure their success.
6. The Business faculty have been promoting this program the entire semester, and we have many students already interested in participating.
7. To secure additional students, we will be holding Information Sessions beginning this month, and running through August. We have already reached out to our K-12 partners, and will be pushing it out through social media, additional marketing strategies and possible news articles.
8. This program would work with all of our ADT's.
9. Completions, completions, completions and transfer, transfer, transfer.

Computer Information Systems is a field that serves 12 different occupational codes. The most popular of these occupational codes includes web development and multimedia and desktop publishers. According to the Centers of Excellence data, in 2010 there were 14,044 jobs available, and in 2015 (in the same occupations) there were only 14,919 available (with average entry level wages beginning at $20.22, median wages at $30.24 and experienced wages at $43.76). This only showcases a 6% increase over the five years in available jobs. The areas for which there was growth (web developers, support specialists and data entry) have an entry wage that ranges from $10.39 - $21.79. The highest growth occupation within Computer Information Systems is within the Computer Analyst field which has ranges between $25.35 and $46.12 per hour. The data does not report the Cyber Security field jobs which data indicates there will be up to 1 million jobs available over the next few years. Based on this job projection data, RCC has expanded the Cyber Security offerings and have streamlined the scheduling patterns of the pathways to ensure that students are completing the program within a shorter period of time and to be ready for employment and the needs of industry.

Automotive Technology is a field that does not usually require an advanced degree, and certificates are all that is needed within the field. There was an anticipated 16% growth between 2010 and 2015 in occupations related to the Automotive industry (per Centers of Excellence data). The entry wage is reported to be $12.84, the median wage is reported at $19.24 and the experienced wage is reported at $30.60. The growth in this field is focused around the automotive service technicians and mechanics, and the entry level wage is reported at $9.61, the

median wage is reported at $15.53, and the experienced wage is reported at $26.61. The RCC Automotive program is developing non-credit pathways in order to provide the community an opportunity to expand their skill sets to earn a higher wage.

5) Reflections on Table 5: Does your college make it clear to students the types of jobs that are available to them if they earn a certificate, versus an associate's degree, versus a bachelor's degree in a particular field? How does your institution help CTE students stack credentials or prepare for transfer? If there is no specific bachelor's degree-level occupation listed for your top five programs, are there other transfer pathways that would be relevant for these programs?

For CTE programs, the college does a good job of providing job and career information. For non-CTE, the college has room for improvement.

For the 5 largest programs, 4 of the 5 have ADTs. The one exception, Automotive, has an associate's degree, but very few students earn that degree. Nursing has CNA – VN – RN path.

The Career and Technical Education division has many stackable certificates, in almost every discipline. These stackable certificates provide students the ability to build upon existing skills to meet industry needs. In order to combat the perpetual unit creep for students, the CTE team is currently creating multiple non-credit pathways for students to expand their skills. These non-credit pathways also include the integration of multiple disciplines. An example is, the employability skills pathway that touches multiple disciplines, as our advisory partners have requested in multiple disciplines to have their employees trained on how to provide good customer service, effective communication techniques, and how to present themselves in the workplace. These pathways can be integrated into the future pathways in all disciplines (both in CTE and in other academic areas).

Additionally, Career and Technical Education is required to report stackable certificates and degree patterns within the brochures of each CTE discipline. Currently, brochures are being revised and re-printed and the CTE website is being revised to provide additional detail for each certificate. Finally, the CTE division is working on a Road MAP (My Academic Plan) that identifies each CTE program (Certificates and Degree patterns) and provides a comprehensive look at when each course is offered, and how long it may take a student to complete each.

As the college develops and refines its pathways maps, information will be provided for students on the types of jobs that are available to them if they earn a certificate versus an associate degree versus a bachelor degree. The RCC web site will be redesigned so that accurate, up-to-date, and easy-to-access information will be available for students.

Note: At institute three, you will receive disaggregated data on student outcomes for transfer, earnings gains, and living wage attainment, for discussion in the first break out session.

Riverside Community College

Table 1. *Tracking Transfer Measures*

	Transfer Out Rate	Transfer with Award Rate
Riverside Community College	15%	5%
Statewide Median	17%	6%
Top College in CA	31%	14%

Table 2. *Major Transfer Partners Measures*

University	Number of Transfers to Each Four-Year Transfer Destination	Percent of Transfers Who Earned an Award Before Transferring
California State University-San Bernardi	79	48%
University Of California-Riverside	53	47%
California Baptist University	44	20%
California State Polytechnic University-	25	64%
California State University-Fullerton	20	30%

Table 3. *College-Wide Employment Outcomes*

	Employed in the 4th Quarter After Exit	Median Change in Earnings	Proportion Who Attained the Regional Living Wage
Riverside Community College	67%	53%	39%
Statewide Median	68%	40%	45%
Top College in CA	81%	93%	87%

Table 4. *Outcomes for Five Largest CTE Programs*

Program	Course Enroll-ments	Employed in the 4th Quarter After Exit in the Largest Five Programs	Median Change in Earnings in the Largest Five Programs	Proportion who Attained the Regional Living Wage in the Largest Five Programs
Child Development/Early Care and Education	2854	67%	81%	19%
Computer Information Systems	1822	65%	36%	35%
Business and Commerce, General	1395	77%	34%	40%
Business Administration	1032	84%	44%	51%
Automotive Technology	982	69%	78%	25%

Table 5. *Occupational Information for the Five Largest CTE Programs*

	Five Year Change in Job Openings	Projected Annual Job Openings	Median Salary
Automotive Technology			
Requires a Postsecondary Non-Degree Award			
Automotive Service Technicians and Mechanics	1,552	418	$34,361
Electronic Equipment Installers and Repairers, Motor Vehicles	9	5	$32,468
Business Administration			
Requires a Bachelor's or Higher			
Administrative Services Managers	500	117	$85,217
Cost Estimators	668	119	$60,361
General and Operations Managers	3,511	896	$87,796
Industrial Production Managers	190	49	$91,187
Management Analysts	420	211	$65,561
Management, All Others	736	243	$51,792
Sales Managers	771	183	$87,484
Business and Commerce, General			
Requires a Bachelor's or Higher			
Administrative Services Managers	500	117	$85,217
Cost Estimators	668	119	$60,361
General and Operations Managers	3,511	896	$87,796
Industrial Production Managers	190	49	$91,187
Management Analysts	420	211	$65,561
Management, All Others	736	243	$51,792
Sales Managers	771	183	$87,484
Computer Information Systems			
Requires a Bachelor's or Higher			
Computer Occupations, All Others	-35	29	$73,278
Computer Security Analysts	143	96	$72,675
Information Systems Analysts	-24	8	$89,980

Requires a Post-Secondary Non- Degree Award			
Computer User Support Specialists	**182**	**135**	**$51,542**
Child Development/Early Care and Education			
Requires an Associate Degree			
Preschool Teachers, Except Special Education	**329**	**146**	**$27,664**
On-The-Job Training, No College Required			
Childcare Workers	**-7,456**	**462**	**$17,264**

Definitions

Cohorts and Time Periods

Transfer: Entering first-time ever in college, degree-seeking community college students in the Fall 2010 term, excluding current and prior high school dual enrollment students, tracked for six calendar years. Transfer students are those in the cohort who ever enrolled at a four-year institution for at least one term after their first term at the community college, within the six-year tracking period.

Employment and Earnings: Skills-builders and students who earned a degree or certificate in 2014-15, and did not enroll in a California community college or transfer to a four-year institution in the subsequent year. Outcomes are based on employment and earnings in 2015-16.

CTE Programs: Program size is based on the number of non-introductory CTE course enrollments in credit programs that have an associated degree or certificate, in 2014-15.

Occupational Information: Five-year changes in job openings reflect the time period from 2010-2015. Projected job openings are for the time period of 2015-2020. All information is specific to the college's Doing What Matters region.

Outcomes

Table 1: Transfer Out Rate: The percentage of students in an entering community college cohort who ever enrolled at a four-year institution for at least one term after their first term at the community college, within six years of first enrolling at the community college, based on information provided by the National Student Clearinghouse.

Table 1: Transfer with Award Rate: The percentage of students in an entering community college cohort who started at your community college and earned a certificate or associate degree from your college prior to their earliest enrollment at a four-year institution, based on information provided by the National Student Clearinghouse.

Table 3: Employed in the 4th Quarter After Exit: Among completers and skills-builder students who last took a non-introductory course or earned an award in the selected year, the percentage who were employed four quarters after exiting the California community college system, based on records from the Employment Development Department's Unemployment Insurance Wage File.

Table 3: Median Change in Earnings: Among completers and skills-builder students who last took a course or earned an award in the selected year, the percentage change in earnings one year before and one year after exiting the California community college system in 2014-15, based on records from the Employment Development Department's Unemployment Insurance Wage File. Only students with pre- and post-wages are included.

Table 3: Proportion Who Attained the Regional Living Wage: Among completers and skills-builder students who last took a course or earned an award in the selected TOP code in 2014-15, the proportion of students who had attained a living wage, based on records from the Employment Development Department's Unemployment Insurance Wage File.

Table 5: Five Year Change in Job Openings: The change in the total number of people employed in the college's Doing What Matters region in occupations associated with the top five CTE programs, between 2010-2015, based on information provided by EMSI.

Table 5: Projected Annual Job Openings: The projected number of annual job openings (including new positions created due to growth and replacement positions created due to retirements and other separation factors) in the college's Doing What Matters region in occupations associated with the top five CTE programs, based on information provided by EMSI.

Table 5: Median Salary: The median annual salaries of people employed in the college's Doing What Matters region in occupations associated with the top five CTE programs, based on information provided by EMSI.

Acknowledgements